Minutes
Architectural Review Board
February 8, 2016
Council Chambers, City Hall
Fredericksburg, Virginia

Members Present
John Harris, Chair
Sabina Weitzman, Vice Chair
Susan Pates
Jamie Scully
Kerri S. Barile
Kenneth McFarland

Members Absent
John Van Zandt

Staff
Erik Nelson
Charles Johnston
Phaun Moore

Mr. Harris called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.

OPENING REMARKS

Mr. Harris determined that a quorum was present and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Mr. Nelson stated they had.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Harris asked if there were any changes or additions to the agenda.

Mr. McFarland added a brief discussion regarding the trees on the Washington Avenue Mall.

Mr. Scully made a motion to accept the agenda as amended. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

REVIEW OF MINUTES

There were no changes to the meeting minutes from January 11, 2016.

Mr. McFarland made a motion to approve the January 11, 2016 meeting minutes as presented. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Mr. Harris asked if any Board member had engaged in *ex parte* communications on any item before the Board. No one indicated that they had engaged in any ex parte communication.

DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Mr. Harris asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board.

Dr. Barile said she had a conflict with Old Business, Item #2, as she was a member of the project team.

Mr. Scully pointed out that New Business, Item #5, on the agenda was his project and he would be abstaining from any discussion and voting.

APPLICATIONS – OLD BUSINESS (No Public Hearing)

1. **James McGhee – Exterior alterations at 121 Caroline Street, consisting of installation of front porch.**

Mr. McGhee reviewed the revisions that he had made to the application. He said he could not flatten the roof.

Mr. Scully said he supported the changes to the application and asked for clarification on the replacement of the pilasters.

Mr. McGhee explained that the existing pilasters had no function and would be coming off. He said the new ones would be real supporting features, their location determined by the space needed to install a downspout for drainage and the window location.

Dr. Barile said that she had previously stated a metal roof was not appropriate for the time period and asked why they decided to keep a metal roof.

Mr. McGhee said it was because of the curve. The only other option would be a built up roof.

Dr. Barile asked if it would be a standing seam, metal roof and asked what type of treatment it would have.

Mr. McGhee said it would be a prefinished, standing seam, metal roof.

Dr. Barile said the metal roof would be less jarring if it were painted to blend with the shingles.

Ms. Weitzman suggested that they consider a flat seam roof if possible.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the application, with the condition that the metal roof be painted to blend with the existing color scheme. Mr. Scully seconded.

Mr. McFarland suggested a friendly amendment that a flat seam roof be installed, if possible. Dr. Barile accepted the friendly amendment. Mr. Scully seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

2. **Fredericksburg City Schools – Exterior alterations at 201 Ferdinand Street (Old Walker Grant School), consisting of installation of mechanical equipment, replacement of windows, addition of improved entryways, and other modifications.**

Susan Pryor and Doug Westmoreland, of Moseley Architects, were present. Mr. Westmoreland gave a short presentation and reviewed their revised plans. He said they would leave one of the entrance canopies. He also noted the bus pull-through area, the dumpster enclosure, and the mechanical screening. He said they could lower the profile of the roof top mechanical units, as had been suggested, and a new proposed color would further subdue their presence. Mr. Westmoreland concluded by reviewing window options.

Dr. David G. Melton, Superintendent of Fredericksburg City Schools, said they were excited to be able to expand the use of the building and looked forward to extensive community use as well.

Ms. Weitzman asked if removing the existing steel windows would be destructive to the building.

Mr. Westmoreland said they will cut them out very carefully because they are also abating asbestos in the glazing.

Mr. Scully reminded the Board that he had spoken previously about the replacement of windows and commented that the Board should hold all projects to the same standard.

Mr. McFarland said he appreciated the changes made to the rooftop mechanical equipment and said that he understood Mr. Scully's concerns regarding the windows. He said the changes were commendable.

Ms. Weitzman agreed that the project was outside the norm of replacing wood windows. She said she thought it was unrealistic to require the retention of inefficient metal windows. Instead, this project was an opportunity to improve the building's energy footprint.

Ms. Pates asked how much the replacement windows cost.

Mr. Westmoreland said the proposed aluminum windows would cost approximately $400,000 compared to $2 million for steel replacement windows. Further, installation of the new steel windows would be more destructive of the historic building.

Mr. Scully asked what the plan was for the existing windows and the awning with signage in the vestibule at the main entrance.

Mr. Westmoreland said the wall was going to be demolished and the signage would be mounted in the lobby. He said the existing canopies were rusted out and were going to be removed due to their poor structural integrity.

Mr. McFarland said he was grateful that the City had the ability to save the school. They are civic buildings and their loss is tragic.

Mr. McFarland said he found the proposed work to be architecturally compatible with the historic aspects of the Historic District and made a motion to approve the exterior alterations at the Original Walker Grant School. Ms. Weitzman seconded. Mr. Scully commended the City on the project and said he thought the sacrifice of the windows was a just compromise. He said

his comments had been to stir a proper discussion. The motion carried 5-0-1 with Dr. Barile abstaining.

APPLICATIONS – NEW BUSINESS (Public Hearing)

3. **Emily A. Rivera – Installation of a non-illuminated 24 inch x 24 inch projecting sign at 1004 Caroline Street.**

The applicant was present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Weitzman said she agreed with the staff memo and made a motion to approve the sign as presented. Ms. Pates seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

4. **John and Wendy Young – Construction of a one-story, 12 foot wide extension to the side of the rear addition of the residence at 128 Caroline Street.**

The applicants were not present. There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the addition as presented. Mr. Scully seconded. The motion carried unanimously.

5. **Jamie Scully – Installation of a picket fence (wood) with gates at 240 Charles Street.**

The applicant was present. There was no public comment.

Mr. McFarland said he found the proposed fence to be architecturally compatible with the historic aspects of the Historic District and made a motion to approve the fence as presented. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried 5-0-1 with Mr. Scully abstaining.

OTHER BUSINESS

1. **Transmittal of Planning Commission agenda.**

Mr. Nelson transmitted the Planning Commission agenda for February 10, 2016.

2. **Discussion of trees on Washington Avenue mall.**

The Board discussed the issue regarding the trees on the Washington Avenue mall. Members of the Board commented that the ARB does not have purview over trees, but suggested individuals weigh in on their own, if they desired.

ADJOURN

Meeting adjourned at 8:38 p.m.

John C Harris

John Harris, ARB Chair