



**Minutes**  
**Architectural Review Board**  
February 11, 2019  
Council Chambers, City Hall  
Fredericksburg, Virginia

**Members Present**

Jonathan Gerlach, Chair  
Sabina Weitzman  
Kerri S. Barile  
Karen Irvin  
James Whitman

**Members Absent**

Carthon Davis, III, Vice Chair  
Susan Pates

**Staff**

Kate Schwartz  
Cathy Eckles

---

Mr. Gerlach called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

**OPENING REMARKS**

Mr. Gerlach determined that a quorum was present, and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz noted that they had.

**APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

Dr. Barile requested to add an item to the agenda under Other Business regarding an update on the various archaeological projects around town. Mr. Gerlach requested to add an item to the agenda under Other Business regarding activating the ARB Liaison Committee to interface with the Historic Fredericksburg Foundation, Inc. Ms. Weitzman motioned to approve the agenda as amended. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

Mr. Gerlach asked if there were any changes or additions to the minutes of the regular meeting dated January 14, 2019. Dr. Barile motioned to make a change to page four, second paragraph from the bottom, third sentence, previously ending in "some possible amendments to the motion" to add the wording, "specifically regarding the brick arches on the primary elevation." Ms. Irvin made a motion to approve the amended minutes. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

**DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had engaged in any *ex parte* communication on any item before the Board. No Board members had any *ex parte* communications to report.

**DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Mr. Gerlach asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board. Mr. Gerlach stated he had a conflict with COA 2019-02, 600 Caroline Street, as his law firm represents the building owner and recused himself from the matter.

**PUBLIC HEARING**

**A. New Business**  
**Signs**

- i. **COA 2019-02** – 600 Caroline Street – Heidi Drummond requests to install one projecting sign on an existing metal bracket for the DermaEnVie business.

The applicant, Heidi Drummond, was present. There were no public comments.

Dr. Barile motioned to approve the application for a new sign as submitted. Mr. Whitman seconded. Motion carried 4-0-1, with Mr. Gerlach recused.

- ii. **COA 2019-07** – 905 Charles Street – Michael Thompson requests to install signs, including two vinyl window decals, for Mike’s Roofing business.

The applicant was not present and there were no public comments.

Ms. Weitzman motioned to approve the application for the signs as submitted. Ms. Irvin seconded. Motion carried 5-0.

#### **Accessory Structures**

- iii. **COA 2019-01** – 1119 Caroline Street - James Massey requests to install accessory structures at this commercial property including wood fencing along the side and rear property lines, a wood storage shed at the rear of the property, and a four-foot tall monument sign at the front of the property.

Melissa Colombo, 418 Bunker Hill Street, was present to represent the applicant. Ms Colombo provided a letter to the Board addressing recommendations the property owners had received from Historic Fredericksburg Foundation, Inc. as the organization holds a preservation easement on the property. Ms. Colombo noted that they were willing to make minor changes to the proposal to satisfy HFFI’s concerns.

Danae Peckler, 1410 Prince Edward Street, spoke as a representative of HFFI. She said they were in support of what the owners are trying to do and some modifications could strengthen the application. She recommended preserving the openness of the property, and supported the lower fence height at the northeast property. For the sign, HFFI supports the use of traditional materials and noted that several freestanding wood signs are present in the area. She said the sign posts could bear a stronger relationship to the building and the overall sign size should be reduced. For the shed, Ms. Peckler said that a rectangular, rather than square, shape would better match the gable roof profile. She also recommended the use of a board-and-batten style door.

There was no other public comment.

Dr. Barile thanked the applicant and HFFI for working together on the application. The Board agreed to address each component of the application individually.

For the proposed fencing, the Board supported the staff recommendation to wrap the four-foot picket-style fence around the northeast corner of the property. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the fencing on condition that all four-foot fencing will be the open picket-style and all elements of the taller fence will be limited to six feet in height. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

For the shed, Ms. Colombo noted that they could extend the shed by two feet in order to make it rectangular. She said they would also be willing to use a board-and-batten style door. Ms. Weitzman noted that the shed was nicely conceived, and care had been taken in the material selection. She said it does not have a squat appearance and doesn't believe it needs the additional two feet; however, she was willing to support it as an option. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the shed with the option to extend the length an additional two feet and on condition that board-and-batten style doors are used. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

The Board discussed elements of the proposed sign, including the use of PVC material and eliminating the recessed panels on the posts. Ms. Colombo noted that they could use a Hardie/fiber cement type material instead, but they were avoiding brick as it would be so hard to match the historic building. Ms. Weitzman asked if the posts would have crisp corners, as this was often where PVC fails as a material. Ms. Colombo said the corners were sharp.

Dr. Barile said she supported the use of smooth posts, without panels, but would have liked to see a material sample. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the sign on condition that the recessed panels on the posts are eliminated. Ms. Irvin seconded. Dr. Barile discussed the material again with Mr. Gerlach and Ms. Peckler and asked if the material could be painted. Ms. Colombo confirmed that it could. Ms. Weitzman amended her motion to add the condition that the posts have a painted finish. Ms. Irvin seconded the amended motion. The motion carried 5-0.

- iv. **COA 2017-80** – 1201 Caroline Street – The City of Fredericksburg Public Works Department requests to modify the previously approved masonry dumpster enclosure in the rear parking lot by increasing the length and height of the walls.

Ray Regan, Director of Public Facilities, was present to represent the application. There was no public comment.

Ms. Irvin and Ms. Weitzman discussed where the gates would be located and how they would be used. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the application as presented. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

#### **Exterior Alterations/Additions**

- v. **COA 2019-03** – 821 Caroline Street – Edward Wright, Jr. requests to make alterations to this commercial building including painting the concrete rear wall, replacing the canvas awning, replacing tile on the building façade, and installing window and awning signs for the Abner B's Ice Cream business.

The applicant, Ed Wright, was present. Mr. Wright said he was looking to replace the tile with yellow and white tile to match the company colors. He had no objection to the style, only to the colors. He also noted that he would be meeting with Kathy Frazier through the Main Street Design Assistance program tomorrow.

There was no public comment.

Dr. Barile said that she concurs with the staff report and believes that the tile is a character-defining feature. The tile reflects the historic fabric, rather than a specific tenant. Mr. Gerlach and Mr. Irvin both agreed and said that the tile is a feature that should be preserved. Ms. Weitzman agreed and noted that she thought Frazier can help make the tile work for Mr. Wright's business.

Ms. Weitzman asked if Mr. Wright had plans to fix the missing window or other deteriorated elements at the back of the building. Mr. Wright said it had been sealed up and he was planning to repair and repaint the mechanical shelf and the rear of the building.

Dr. Barile clarified to Mr. Wright why they would be denying the tile replacement and noted that while they supported his project, the tile is a historic feature that they are responsible for preserving. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the awning replacement and the installation of signs as submitted and to paint the concrete block wall at the rear of the building on condition that an appropriate masonry primer is used. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

Dr. Barile made a motion to deny the replacement of the tile on the front façade because it does not meet standard two. Ms. Weitzman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- vi. COA 2019-04 – 1700 Caroline Street – Ed Whelan requests to install one building-mounted sign and make alterations including installing light fixtures and a roof-mounted exhaust fan for the Old Silk Mill building.**

The applicant, Ed Whelan, was present. Mr. Whelan commented that the lighting was important for security and safety especially since a car had run into the building for the eighth time the previous weekend.

There was no public comment.

Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the application on condition that the sign and lights are attached through the building's mortar joints rather than the historic brick. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- vii. COA 2019-05 – 201 Princess Anne Street – William Tucker requests to construct a two-story addition at the rear of this single-family residence and make alterations, including replacing three non-historic windows and installing a porch roof over the front entry stoop.**

The applicant, Bill Tucker, was present. The property owners, Dikchya and Chastaine Perry were also present. Mr. and Mrs. Perry said they were asking to construct a roof over the front porch in order to deal with several practical concerns. They said the front door was rotting and no warranty was available for a new wood door that would not be sheltered. They also want a sheltered entry for comfort and for package delivery.

There was no public comment.

The Board agreed to address each component of the application individually. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the replacement of three windows as submitted. Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

Dr. Barile discussed the proposed porch roof and noted that the Board has voted to reconstruct historic elements previously and is something that could be considered. She did note that the design proposed has never existed previously on this house and may not be appropriate. She noted that this was the introduction of a Colonial Revival element on a house where it never existed. Ms.

Weitzman said that a simple shed-style roof may be more appropriate. She also noted that this might be an opportunity for a contemporary design that would never be mistaken for the original.

Ms. Irvin said that the two-story porch on the proposed addition refers to more traditional detailing, and she would want to see more contemporary vocabulary throughout. She said she supported the use of a simple shed roof. Dr. Barile agreed and said that a very shallow shed would be similar to the earlier porch, but different enough to not be confused for the same one. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the addition of a porch roof on condition that it has a shallow-pitched shed-style roof. Dr. Barile seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

Mr. Gerlach complimented the design of the new addition and said that it pays homage to the historic fabric without being falsely historical. Dr. Barile complimented the maintenance of the historic fenestration.

Mr. Gerlach asked for clarification of where the Boral material would be used. Mr. Tucker said it would be used only for trim elements and would not be used to hold weight. Dr. Barile asked for confirmation that the metal roof would be crimped on site. Mr. Tucker said that it would. Ms. Weitzman clarified that the spaces between the porch piers would be open. Ms. Weitzman made a motion to approve the rear addition as presented with the recommendation that the applicants monitor for archaeological deposits during construction and report any findings to City staff. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

- viii. COA 2019-06 – 309 Caroline Street – William Tucker requests to make alterations to the detached garage building, including constructing a two-story rear addition and replacing the garage doors with new doors and windows.**

The applicant, Bill Tucker, was present. Mr. Tucker said the addition was planned to be as far back from the street as possible. The intention is to build from the existing walls of the rear section of the garage, but they may be de facto demolished and rebuilt depending on condition.

There was no public comment.

Ms. Weitzman and Ms. Irvin discussed the depiction of rooflines in the submitted drawings and the interaction with neighboring properties to determine if they were shown accurately. Mr. Tucker agreed that there was an error in the drawing, but noted that the new second story addition would be behind the neighboring structure on Frederick Street.

Mr. Gerlach asked for confirmation of the overall height and asked if it would be lower than the main house. Mr. Tucker confirmed that it would. Mr. Gerlach also asked Mr. Tucker if the staff recommendations were acceptable to him. He agreed that they were. Dr. Barile made a motion to approve the application with the conditions recommended by staff:

1. The windows will be constructed of wood with optional aluminum cladding and with true or simulated divided lights. If simulated, spacer bars will be included between the glass panes.
2. The garage doors and entry door will be constructed of wood with optional aluminum cladding.
3. All trim elements will be constructed of wood to match the existing structure.

Ms. Irvin seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

## **GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT**

There was no public comment.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

### **A. Archaeology Projects**

Dr. Barile provided an update on recent archaeological investigations in the city, including at the George Street Tunnel, the Slave Auction Block, and Riverfront Park. She noted that the tunnel and slave block studies had been submitted to VDOT and would be disseminated in three to four weeks. She said that both sites had been recommended as contributing to their associated buildings and as objects in the National Register district. Dr. Barile also reviewed some of the findings from the most recent Riverfront Park digs and discussed the Aquia sandstone that had been found and recovered.

### **B. Liaison Committee**

Mr. Gerlach noted that the Liaison Committee had been created last year and recommended that it was time to activate the committee to work with HFFI and ensure collaboration with the organization.

## **STAFF UPDATE**

### **A. Transmittal of Planning Commission Agenda – February 13, 2019**

There were no comments or questions.

### **B. Transmittal of updated economic incentives informational sheet**

Ms. Schwartz noted that the handout had been updated with the new Main Street Zero Interest Loan program and with the C-PACE clean energy financing program. The sheet is available through the City's Economic Development and Planning Departments, online, and through Main Street.

### **C. 2019 CLG Training Workshops**

Ms. Schwartz said that spaces were still available in several of the workshops to be hosted by DHR in 2019. She noted that the workshops are a great opportunity to meet the annual training requirement for Board members to maintain the City's Certified Local Government status.

### **D. Update on the Historic Preservation Working Group**

Ms. Schwartz briefed the Board on a series of recommendations made by the Historic Preservation Working Group for updates to the City Code, Historic Preservation Plan, and Historic District Handbook. The proposed code amendments are scheduled to be initiated by the City Council on February 12 and would be reviewed by the ARB in more detail at the March meeting. Public hearings would be held before the Planning Commission and City Council in March and April.

**COMMITTEE UPDATE**

There were no updates from committees.

**CHAIRMAN'S REPORT**

The chairman had nothing further to report.

**ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting adjourned at 9:11 p.m.



---

Jonathan Gerlach, ARB Chair

