



Minutes
Architectural Review Board
April 12, 2021

Electronic Meeting and Council Chambers

Members Present

Jonathan Gerlach, Chair
Karen Irvin, Vice Chair
Adriana Moss
Helen P. Ross
James Whitman

Members Absent

Sabina Weitzman

Staff

Kate Schwartz

Chairman Gerlach called the Architectural Review Board meeting to order at 7:00 p.m.

OPENING REMARKS

Chairman Gerlach stated that the meeting was being held both in-person and electronically through the “GoTo Meeting” application, pursuant to City Council Ordinance 20-05, An Ordinance to Address Continuity of City Government during the Pendency of a Pandemic Disaster. The members participating were Jonathan Gerlach, Karen Irvin, Adriana Moss, Helen P. Ross, and James Whitman. Members of the public have been invited to access this meeting by public access television Cox Channel 84, Verizon Channel 42, online at www.regionalwebtv.com, or on Facebook Live at www.facebook.com/FXBGgov.

Chairman Gerlach determined that a quorum of 5 members was present, and asked if public notice requirements had been met. Ms. Schwartz confirmed that they had.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Mr. Whitman made a motion to approve the agenda as submitted. Ms. Ross seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

DISCLOSURE OF EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

Chairman Gerlach asked if any Board member had engaged in any *ex parte* communication on any item before the Board. Ms. Ross said she had spoken with the property owners at 1320 Caroline Street when visiting the site, but did not discuss the specifics of the application.

DISCLOSURE OF CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Chairman Gerlach asked if any Board member had a conflict of interest for any item before the Board. Chairman Gerlach said that he represented clients of the applicant for COA 2021-23 at 1015 Prince Edward Street and would not participate in the consent agenda as a result.

CONSENT AGENDA

- A. COA 2021-13 – 1011 Caroline Street – Sign Installation
- B. COA 2021-14 – 502B Sophia Street – Sign Installation
- C. COA 2021-15 – 301 Charles Street – Fence Installation

- D. COA 2021-20 – 820 Caroline Street – Sign Installation
- E. COA 2021-21 – 130 Caroline Street – Fence Installation
- F. COA 2021-22 – 1320 Caroline Street – Fence Installation
- G. COA 2021-23 – 1015 Prince Edward Street – Fence Installation
- H. COA 2021-24 – 530 Princess Anne Street – Sign Installation

Ms. Moss made a motion to approve the consent agenda as submitted. Mr. Whitman seconded. The motion carried 4-0-1 with Chairman Gerlach abstaining.

PUBLIC HEARING

New Applications

- A. COA 2021-16 – 922-924 Caroline Street – James Newton requests to remove the molded cornice from the façade of this commercial building due to its deteriorated condition.

The applicant was present. Mr. Newton shared his family history with the building and said that two early buildings had been combined to make the present space. He said the Rite Aid renovation in the 1970s was not compatible with the district and that the cosmetic molding pieces do not have artistic or architectural integrity. He said removing the trim would bring the building more in line with neighboring buildings.

Gretchen Pendleton, on behalf of the Historic Fredericksburg Foundation, Inc., submitted public comment supporting removal of the Colonial Revival features of the building.

Ms. Ross discussed the history of the property with Mr. Newton and confirmed that no photos from before the building's conversion to the Peoples Drug Store had been found. Chairman Gerlach asked several clarifying questions about the scope of work and confirmed that if removed, the wall would be repaired. Mr. Newton stated that he had received a number of quotes for the work and that it would be very expensive to repair the cornice.

Mr. Whitman said that he was sympathetic to the high cost and would support removing the cornice on condition that the wall was repaired.

Ms. Ross noted that the current façade dates to 1973 when the early ARB was attempting to make the building more compatible with the district. Removal of the cornice would not fully restore the building or match the appearance of the building at street level and would signal that something was missing. She said she was inclined toward the staff recommendation for retaining the cornice.

Ms. Irvin said she agreed with the staff recommendation, noting that the building has gone through many changes, but that it isn't appropriate or good preservation practice to selectively choose which features and styles to keep.

Ms. Moss said she understood the financial burden, but that the Colonial Revival style was a distinct movement in the city. Either the building should be fully restored to the earlier Modern appearance, or it should be maintained in its current design. Chairman Gerlach agreed and said that while the

cornice is not original, its removal does not restore the building. He noted that the 1970s elements would likely not hold up well and said he supported eventual restoration of the Modern façade.

The application will be included on the April 26, 2021 meeting agenda for action.

- B. COA 2021-17 – 401 Hanover Street – Anna Mitsis-Mozena requests to replace the porch decking on the front and side porches at this commercial property with new IPE wood decking.

The applicant was not present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Ross asked staff to confirm that the existing wood trim on the sides of the porch would be repaired in kind. Ms. Irvin asked how the Ipe decking would be finished. Ms. Schwartz said she would work with the applicant to answer these questions prior to the April 28 meeting.

Board members noted that the proposal appeared to meet the district guidelines, though the applicant would need to provide answers to the Board's questions. The application will be included on the April 26, 2021 meeting agenda for action.

- C. COA 2021-18 – 200 Hanover Street – JFH Fredericksburg III, LLC requests to make alterations to the exterior of this commercial building including replacing two exterior doors, reconfiguring a rear courtyard entry, and installing exterior lighting.

The property owner, James Jarrell IV, was present. There was no public comment.

Ms. Irvin asked if the door designs would match the specifications or the elevations. Mr. Jarrell said the cut sheets provided are accurate.

Ms. Ross asked for additional detail on the use of the wall washers. Mr. Jarrell explained that they were structural due to a bow in the rear brick wall. Ms. Ross also asked Mr. Jarrell to consider alternatives to wood for the rooftop equipment screen. Mr. Jarrell said they were trying to avoid the additional weight of metal, but were open to suggestions.

All Board members said they were generally in support of the application and that it met the standards for the district. The application will be included on the April 26, 2021 meeting agenda for action.

- D. COA 2021-19 – 1305 Sophia Street – James E. Jarrell IV requests to make alterations to this single-family residence as a component of a larger repair and rehabilitation project including reconfiguration of the front entry porch, replacing gutters and downspouts, alteration to window and door openings on the side porch, and replacing shutters.

The applicant was present as well as Gibson Worsham, the project architect. Mr. Worsham said that investigation of the entry portico showed that the columns were not original, but were salvaged from another historic property, and that the door and other mismatched elements were installed in the last 30 years or so. This project is an attempt to create a design that is appropriate to the house and the district.

Gretchen Pendleton, on behalf of Historic Fredericksburg Foundation, Inc., submitted comment opposing the alterations to the residence's original historic elements.

Mr. Whitman said he was in support of the application as submitted.

Ms. Ross asked several clarifying questions regarding the Asher Benjamin panel used for inspiration, the molding details, and the gutter profiles and measurements. Ms. Ross asked if the extended brick stoop would match the brick bond of the existing. Mr. Worsham said the entire stoop would be redone after establishing a foundation for the columns, but that the brick bond would be recreated.

Ms. Irvin said that the proposed changes appear to be appropriate to the house. She asked for additional specifications on the porch door and main entry door. Mr. Jarrell confirmed that the porch door would not be a Dutch door. Ms. Irvin also clarified details of the trim profiles with Mr. Worsham.

Ms. Moss said she appreciated the salvage and reuse of existing materials and said the changes appeared to be compatible with the house and in line with the standards and guidelines. Chairman Gerlach agreed and noted that the applicant should include any exterior lighting with the application if proposed. Mr. Jarrell asked if a minor alteration to the roof proposal could be incorporated into the application. Ms. Schwartz said she would transmit the details to the Board for consideration.

The application will be included on the April 26, 2021 meeting agenda for action.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no general public comment.

OTHER BUSINESS

A. Discussion of Historic District Handbook Draft

Chairman Gerlach said that the new handbook was much improved and noted that creation of the document included input from the preservation community, the development community, and many other stakeholders. Ms. Irvin agreed and said that this will make it easier for the public and for the Board in understanding and communicating the district requirements. Ms. Ross and Ms. Moss each offered a handful of specific comments or clarifications and said they would send those to Ms. Schwartz by email. Ms. Schwartz asked that Board members submit any comments by April 26 so that the updated draft could be distributed prior to the May public hearing.

B. Discussion of Preservation Plan Comprehensive Plan Amendment

Chairman Gerlach said this was a great improvement and recommended that the ARB pass a resolution in support. Ms. Irvin and Ms. Ross agreed. Ms. Irvin made a motion stating that the ARB has reviewed the draft preservation plan as an amendment to the Comprehensive Plan and recommends approval to the Planning Commission and City Council. Ms. Moss seconded. The motion carried 5-0.

STAFF UPDATE

Ms. Schwartz noted that the archaeology ordinance was on the City Council agenda for April 13 and that the preservation plan was on the Planning Commission agenda for April 14.

ANNOUNCEMENTS AND REPORTS

There were no announcements or reports.

ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Gerlach adjourned the meeting at 8:31 p.m.



Jonathan Gerlach, Chair

DRAFT

